דַּף יוֹמִי · עֲרָכִין · דַּף ט׳

Daf Yomi · The Full Daf · Elucidated Talmud · Navy & Gold Edition · with Rashi

📖 THE SUGYA

In this sugya, the Gemara continues its deep dive into the calendar calculations of Beis Din, analyzing how many full (thirty-day) or deficient (twenty-nine-day) months can be established in a single year. The shakla v'tarya focuses on understanding the underlying reason for the limits set by the Sages, weighing the risk of public confusion or mockery if the moon's appearance strays too far from the day Beis Din sanctifies Rosh Hashanah.

All introductions, summaries, and contextual notes are the editor's commentary and are not part of the original text.

עמוד א׳ DAF 9A

QUESTION

קָדֵים אָתֵי סֵיהֲרָא תְּלָתָא יוֹמֵי!

The new moon will come early by **three days** relative to Rosh HaShana, and people will mock Beis Din for ignoring the astronomical reality!

QUESTION

הַשְׁתָּא נָמֵי קָא קָדֵים אָתֵי תְּרֵי יוֹמֵי.

The Gemara asks: But **now, as well,** when there are eight full months in a year, the new moon **comes early** by **two days,** which should also cause people to mock Beis Din!

ANSWER

כִּדְאָמַר רַב מְשַׁרְשִׁיָא, כִּגְוֹן שֶׁהָיְתָה שָׁנָה מְעוּבֶּרֶת,

The Gemara answers: It is **as Rav Mesharshiyya says** in another context: We are dealing with a case **where the year was a leap year,**

EXPLANATION

הָכָא נָמֵי כִּגְוֹן שֶׁהָיְתָה שָׁנָה שֶׁלְּפָנֶיהָ מְעוּבֶּרֶת, וְעִיבּוּר שָׁנָה חוֹדֶשׁ.

here too, we are dealing with a case **where the year before it was a leap year, and the extra month of the leap year** was a deficient month of twenty-nine days.

EXPLANATION

דַּל יַרְחָא מַלְיָא בַּהֲדֵי יַרְחָא חַסִּירָא,

Therefore, **deduct one full month** of thirty days from this year's calculation **corresponding to the deficient month** added in the previous leap year, leaving only seven effective full months.

QUESTION

וְאַכַּתִּי חַד יוֹמָא!

The Gemara asks: **But still,** even with seven full months, the new moon precedes Rosh HaShana by **one day!**

ANSWER

לָא אַדַּעְתַּיְיהוּ דְּאִינָשֵׁי.

The Gemara answers: A discrepancy of one day **is not on people's minds,** so they will not mock Beis Din.

STATEMENT

עוּלָּא אָמַר: לֹא נִרְאָה לַחֲכָמִים לְחַסֵּר יָתֵר עַל שְׁמוֹנָה,

Ulla said a different interpretation of the Mishnah: The phrase **"it did not seem proper to the Sages"** means they did not see fit **to make deficient more than eight** months in a single year.

EXPLANATION

וּמַאי טַעְמָא קָאָמַר —

And it is saying "what is the reason": The Mishnah is explaining the reason for its previous ruling, as if asking:

QUESTION

מָה טַעַם אֵין פּוֹחֲתִים מֵאַרְבָּעָה חֳדָשִׁים הַמְעוּבָּרִים בְּשָׁנָה —

What is the reason we do not reduce below four full months in a year?

ANSWER

מִשּׁוּם דְּלֹא נִרְאָה לַחֲכָמִים לְחַסֵּר יָתֵר עַל שְׁמוֹנָה.

Because it did not seem proper to the Sages to make deficient more than eight months in a year, which automatically leaves at least four full months.

QUESTION

מַאי שְׁנָא תִּשְׁעָה דְּלָא, דְּאִם כֵּן מְיַיתְּרָא סֵיהֲרָא תְּלָתָא יוֹמֵי,

The Gemara asks: **What is different about nine** deficient months **that** Beis Din does **not** establish? Is it **because if so, the new moon would lag behind** Rosh HaShana by **three days,** making Beis Din look foolish?

QUESTION

הַשְׁתָּא נָמֵי קָא מְיַיתְּרָא תְּרֵי יוֹמֵי!

Now, as well, with eight deficient months, **it lags behind** by **two days!**

ANSWER

כִּדְאָמַר רַב מְשַׁרְשִׁיָא, כְּגוֹן שֶׁהָיְתָה שָׁנָה מְעוּבֶּרֶת,

The Gemara answers: It is **as Rav Mesharshiyya says: Where the year was a leap year,**

EXPLANATION

הָכָא נָמֵי כְּגוֹן שֶׁהָיְתָה שָׁנָה שֶׁלְּפָנֶיהָ מְעוּבֶּרֶת,

here too, we are dealing with a case **where the year before it was a leap year** with an extra full month of thirty days.

EXPLANATION

דֵּל יַרְחָא חַסִּירָא בַּהֲדֵי יַרְחָא מַלְיָא.

So **deduct one deficient month** from this year **corresponding to the extra full month** of last year, leaving only seven effective deficient months.

QUESTION

וְאַכַּתְּי אִיכָּא חַד יוֹמָא,

The Gemara asks: **But still, there is** a lag of **one day** between Rosh HaShana and the moon's appearance!

ANSWER

סָבְרִי: אִיתְחֲזוֹיֵי אִיתְחֲזִי וַאֲנַן לָאו אַדַּעְתִּין.

The Gemara answers: People **will assume: It was indeed visible** yesterday when Beis Din declared the new month, **and we simply were not paying attention** to notice it.

עמוד ב׳ DAF 9B

QUESTION

בְּמַאי קָמִיפַּלְגִי?

Over what fundamental principle **do they disagree?** What is the root machlokes between Rav Huna and Ulla regarding the length of months in a year?

ANSWER

בְּעִיבּוּר שָׁנָה,

The Gemara answers: They disagree **regarding the intercalation of a year,** i.e. how many days are added during a leap year when adding the extra month of Adar Sheni,

PROOF

דְּתַנְיָא: כַּמָּה עִיבּוּר שָׁנָה — שְׁלֹשִׁים,

as it was taught in a Braisa: How much time is added in **the intercalation of a year? Thirty** full **days,** meaning the leap month is always a full thirty-day month.

STATEMENT

רַבָּן שִׁמְעוֹן בֶּן גַּמְלִיאֵל אוֹמֵר: חוֹדֶשׁ.

Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel says: A month, meaning a standard deficient month of twenty-nine days. Now, Rav Huna holds like the Tanna Kamma, so he allows more thirty-day full months in the calendar, whereas Ulla holds like Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel.

OBJECTION

מֵיתִיבִי: אֵין עֲצֶרֶת חָלָה אֶלָּא בְּיוֹם הָנָּה,

The Gemara **raises an objection** against Rav Huna from a Braisa: **Shavuos falls only on the day of the week of the waving** of the Omer, which is the sixteenth of Nisan, the second day of Pesach;

OBJECTION

וְאֵין רֹאשׁ הַשָּׁנָה חָלָה אֶלָּא אוֹ בְּיוֹם הָנֵף אוֹ לְאוֹר עִיבּוּרוֹ.

and Rosh Hashanah falls only either on the day of the week of the waving, or on the night of its intercalation, meaning two days after the day of the waving, which corresponds to the third day of Pesach.

EXPLANATION

בְּשִׁלְמָא לְעוּלָּא, דְּשָׁמוֹנָה חֲסֵירִין עָבְדִינַן, מֵעוּבָּרִין לָא עָבְדִינַן — מַשְׁכַּחַתְּ לַהּ.

Now, **it works out well according to Ulla, who says that we may make eight deficient** months in a year, but **we do not make** eight **full** months; **you can find it** working out smoothly:

EXPLANATION

שְׁנֵיהֶן חָסֵר — בְּיוֹם הָנֵף.

If **both of them,** i.e., both Cheshvan and Kislev, are **deficient,** adding extra deficient months between Pesach and Rosh Hashanah, Rosh Hashanah falls **on the day of the waving.**

EXPLANATION

אֶחָד מָלֵא וְאֶחָד חָסֵר — לְאוֹר עִיבּוּרוֹ.

And if **one is full and one is deficient,** as in a standard alternating year, Rosh Hashanah falls **on the night of its intercalation,** two days after the day of waving.

QUESTION

אֶלָּא לְרַב הוּנָא דְּאָמַר: עָבְדִינַן מְעוּבָּרִין,

But according to Rav Huna, who said we may make eight **full** months in a year,

OBJECTION

הָא זִימְנִין דְּמַשְׁכַּחַתְּ לְאוֹר אוֹר עִיבּוּרוֹ!

behold, there are times when you find that Rosh Hashanah falls on **the night of the night of its intercalation,** three days after the day of waving! For if extra full months are added during the summer, Rosh Hashanah would be pushed off even further, contradicting the Braisa!

REFUTATION

אָמַר לְךָ רַב הוּנָא: וּלְעוּלָּא מִי נִיחָא?

Rav Huna could say to you: And according to Ulla, does it work out well?

EXPLANATION

שְׁמוֹנָה הוּא דְּלָא עָבְדִינַן, הָא שִׁבְעָה עָבְדִינַן.

It is only **eight** full months **that we do not make, but seven** full months **we do make!**

OBJECTION

שִׁבְעָה זִימְנִין דְּלָא עָבְדִינַן בְּסִיתְוָא וְעָבְדִינַן בְּקַיְיטָא, וְהָא הַוָה לְאוֹר אוֹר עִיבּוּרוֹ!

And if there are **seven** full months, **there are times when we do not make** the extra full month **in the winter, and** instead **we make it in the summer,** between Pesach and Rosh Hashanah; **and behold, it would then fall on the night of the night of its intercalation!** So Ulla faces the same difficulty!

RESOLUTION

אֶלָּא, הָא מַנִּי? אַחֵרִים הִיא,

Rather, whose opinion is this Braisa? **It is** the opinion of **Acherim,** who maintain a fixed calendar system,

PROOF

דְּתַנְיָא: אַחֵרִים אוֹמְרִים: אֵין בֵּין עֲצֶרֶת לַעֲצֶרֶת, וְאֵין בֵּין רֹאשׁ הַשָּׁנָה לְרֹאשׁ הַשָּׁנָה,

as it was taught in a Braisa: Acherim say, there is no difference **between** Shavuos of one year and **Shavuos** of the next year, **and there is no** difference **between Rosh Hashanah** of one year **and Rosh Hashanah** of the next year,

PROOF

אֶלָּא אַרְבָּעָה יָמִים בִּלְבַד, וְאִם הָיְתָה שָׁנָה מְעוּבֶּרֶת — חֲמִשָּׁה.

except for four days alone in a regular year, because the months always alternate strictly; **and if it was a leap year,** the difference is **five** weekdays.

QUESTION

סוֹף סוֹף, לַאַחֵרִים, בְּיוֹם הֶנֵּף — לָא מַשְׁכַּחַתְּ לַהּ!

The Gemara asks: **Ultimately, according to Acherim, you still cannot find** a case where Rosh Hashanah falls **on the day of the waving!** Since they hold that months strictly alternate, there are never extra deficient months added in the summer to pull Rosh Hashanah back to the day of waving!

ANSWER

אָמַר רַב מְשַׁרְשִׁיָא: כְּגוֹן שֶׁהָיְתָה שָׁנָה מְעוּבֶּרֶת, וְעִיבּוּר שָׁנָה שְׁלֹשִׁים יוֹם,

Rav Mesharshiya said: For example, where it was a leap year, and the intercalation of the year consisted of a full **thirty-day** leap month,

EXPLANATION

דַּל יַרְחָא לְבַהֲדֵי יַרְחָא, דְּמַשְׁכַּחַתְּ לָהּ בְּיוֹם הֶנֵּף.

and you **remove one month** after Pesach by making it deficient **corresponding to the extra month** added before Pesach, so **that you can find it** falling **on the day of the waving.**

QUESTION

אָמַר לֵיהּ רַב אַדָּא בַּר אַהֲבָה לְרָבָא: "אַחֵרִים", מִנְיָנָא אַתָּא לְאַשְׁמוֹעִינַן?

Rav Adda bar Ahavah said to Rava: Did Acherim come to inform us merely of a mathematical **count** of days between years?

ANSWER

הָא קָא מַשְׁמַע לַן, דְּלָא בָּעֵינַן מִצְוָה לְקַדֵּשׁ עַל פִּי הָרְאָיָה.

Rava answered: **This is what it teaches us: that we do not require the mitzvah to sanctify** the month strictly **according to the sighting** of the new moon if it disturbs the fixed sequence of months.

OBJECTION

מַתְקִיף לַהּ רָבִינָא וְהָאִיכָּא יוֹמָא דְּשָׁעֵי, וְיוֹמָא דְּתְלָתִין שְׁנֵי,

Ravina raised an objection to it: But is there not the day of the hours, and the day of thirty years? Meaning, the solar-lunar offset accumulates extra hours and parts, which forces an extra day every few years, ruining this exact fixed calculation!

ANSWER

כֵּיוָן דְּלֵיתֵיהּ בְּכֹל שַׁתָּא לָא קָא חָשֵׁיב.

The Gemara answers: **Since it is not present in every year,** the Tanna **does not count** those rare leap-adjustments in his general rule.

PROOF

וְאַף שְׁמוּאֵל סָבַר לַהּ כְּרַב הוּנָא,

The Gemara notes: **And Shmuel also holds like Rav Huna,** that we may establish eight full months in a year,

PROOF

דְּאָמַר שְׁמוּאֵל: אֵין שְׁנַת לְבָנָה פְּחוּתָה מִשְּׁלֹשׁ מֵאוֹת וַחֲמִשִּׁים וּשְׁתַּיִם יוֹם,

for Shmuel said: A lunar year is not less than three hundred and fifty-two days if there are eight deficient months,

PROOF

וְלֹא יְתֵירָה עַל שְׁלֹשׁ מֵאוֹת וַחֲמִשִּׁים וְשִׁשָּׁה יוֹם.

and not more than three hundred and fifty-six days if there are eight full months, which agrees with Rav Huna.

QUESTION

הָא כֵּיצַד?

How so? How do these numbers break down?

EXPLANATION

שְׁנֵיהֶם מְלֵאִין — שִׁשָּׁה,

If **both of them,** i.e. Cheshvan and Kislev, are **full,** the year has three hundred and fifty-**six** days.

EXPLANATION

שְׁנֵיהֶם חֲסֵירִין — שְׁנַיִם,

If **both of them are deficient,** it has three hundred and fifty-**two** days.

EXPLANATION

אֶחָד מָלֵא וְאֶחָד חָסֵר — אַרְבָּעָה.

If **one is full and one is deficient,** it has three hundred and fifty-**four** days.

OBJECTION

מֵיתִיבִי: הֲרֵינִי נָזִיר "כִּימוֹת הַחַמָּה" — מוֹנֶה נְזִירוּת שְׁלֹשׁ מֵאוֹת וְשִׁשִּׁים וַחֲמִשָּׁה יָמִים, כְּמִנְיַן יְמוֹת הַחַמָּה.

The Gemara **raises an objection:** If a person says, **"I am hereby a nazir like the days of the sun," he counts a nezirus of three hundred and sixty-five days, like the count of the days of the solar year.**

OBJECTION

"כִּימוֹת הַלְּבָנָה" — מוֹנֶה נְזִירוּת שְׁלֹשׁ מֵאוֹת וַחֲמִשִּׁים וְאַרְבָּעָה יָמִים, כְּמִנְיַן יְמוֹת הַלְּבָנָה.

If he says, **"Like the days of the moon," he counts a nezirus of three hundred and fifty-four days, like the count of the days of the lunar year.**

OBJECTION

וְאִם אִיתָא, זִימְנִין דְּמַשְׁכַּחַתְּ לַהּ שִׁשָּׁה!

And if it is so that a year can have eight full months as Rav Huna and Shmuel hold, **there are times when you find it** having three hundred and fifty-**six** days! Why then does the Braisa specify three hundred and fifty-four?

ANSWER

בִּנְדָרִים הַלֵּהּ אַחַר לְשׁוֹן בְּנֵי אָדָם, וְרוֹב שָׁנִים.

The Gemara answers: **In nederim, follow the common language of people, and** people refer to **the majority of years,** which are standard alternating years of three hundred and fifty-four days.

PROOF

וְאַף רַבִּי סָבַר לַהּ כְּרַב הוּנָא,

The Gemara notes: **And Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi also holds like Rav Huna,**

PROOF

דְּתַנְיָא: מַעֲשֶׂה וְעָשָׂה רַבִּי (כְּרַב הוּנָא) תִּשְׁעָה חֲסֵירִים,

as it was taught in a Braisa: It once happened that Rabbi made nine deficient months in a single year,

PROOF

וְנִרְאָה חוֹדֶשׁ בִּזְמַנּוֹ,

and the new moon appeared in its time, on the thirtieth day,

PROOF

וְהָיָה רַבִּי תָּמֵיהַּ וְאוֹמֵר: עָשִׂינוּ תִּשְׁעָה חֲסֵירִין וְנִרְאָה חוֹדֶשׁ בִּזְמַנּוֹ!

and Rabbi was astonished and said: "We made nine deficient months, **and the new moon appeared in its time!"**

EXPLANATION

אָמַר לְפָנָיו רַבִּי שִׁמְעוֹן בַּר רַבִּי: שֶׁמָּא שָׁנָה מְעוּבֶּרֶת הָיְתָה?

Rabbi Shimon, the son of Rabbi, said before him: "Perhaps it was a leap year?" This shows that normally Rabbi held you can adjust the lengths of months according to necessity.

SUMMARY

The Gemara contrasts the views of Rav Huna and Ulla regarding the maximum number of full versus deficient months permitted in a year, explaining how past leap years affect the math and how the public perceives discrepancies between the visual moon and Beis Din's declaration. The Amoraim align their views with the Tannaitic machlokes between the Tanna Kamma and Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel regarding the length of the leap month. Finally, the Gemara challenges both opinions from a Braisa detailing the fixed day-of-the-week alignments of Shavuos and Rosh Hashanah, ultimately resolving the difficulty by attributing the Braisa to the shita of Acherim, who hold of a strictly alternating monthly calendar.

לְמַעֲשֶׂה WHAT TO TAKE HOME

The Gemara is dealing with the intricate mechanics of how Beis Din establishes the calendar, balancing the molad against human observation. In the middle of the give-and-take, the Gemara explains why a slight discrepancy between the reality of the moon and the day Beis Din set wouldn't bother people: "Savori: Aithazoye aithazi va'anan lav ad'atin", people simply assume, "The moon was probably visible, we just didn't pay attention." When it comes to something as central as the Jewish calendar, Yidden give the benefit of the doubt and assume they just missed it.

Think about what Chazal are revealing here. So often in life, when we see something that doesn't seem to make sense, or when we observe another Yid acting in a way that looks questionable, our natural impulse is to assume a defect in them. We jump to conclusions, we judge, and we wonder how they could be so off. But the mindset of a Yid is supposed to be: "Anan lav ad'atin", maybe I just didn't see the whole picture. Maybe there's a rationale, a backstory, or a perspective I missed completely.

This isn't just about calendar math; it's a deep avodah in how we view the world and the people around us. Before you rush to critique or feel baffled by someone else's conduct today, stop and apply this gemara to your daily life. Practice saying to yourself: "I wasn't paying attention to the full story." Give the other person the same benefit of the doubt that Chazal assumed Yidden naturally give to Beis Din.

Today, when you see a situation with a friend, spouse, or coworker that looks wrong or frustrating, pause and explicitly tell yourself: "I probably don't have all the facts" before you judge.